

Bachelors of Mathematics Education Work as Non-educator: Why is It Happen?

Sylviyani Hardiarti^{1, a)} and Marsigit^{2, b)}

¹*Graduate Program of Mathematics Education, Yogyakarta State University
Jl Colombo No 1, Karangmalang, Depok, Sleman, Yogyakarta, Indonesia*

²*Mathematics Education Departement, Faculty of Mathematics and Science, Yogyakarta State University
Jl Colombo No 1, Karangmalang, Depok, Sleman, Yogyakarta, Indonesia*

^{a)}sylviyani.hardiarti2016@student.uny.ac.id

^{b)}marsigit@uny.ac.id

Abstract. The aim of this study is to describe the causes why bachelors of mathematics education work as non-educator. This study is a qualitative research with phenomenology approach. Data were collected by documentation and in-depth interviews. Sources of data were 10 bachelors of mathematics education who work as a non-educator. Data analysis was done by finding the theme, then determining the relationship between the parties to gain understanding. The results of the study are: First, the reason for continuing lectures in mathematics education was not entirely to be an educator; Second, the number of human resources and employment is not balanced; Third, the income received by honorary teachers is not appropriate to the needs (financial reward); Fourth, feel no talent and desire to educate; and Fifth, the perception that the work of bachelor of mathematics education is flexible.

INTRODUCTION

In general, humans have the nature to pursue and achieve something that has been aspired. Continuing study to college is one form of an individual trying to reach his goals. This is the first step and preparation to get a job in accordance with the course that he took. The knowledge and experience gained during the eight to fourteen semesters serve as the basis and benchmark that usher in and use in the world of work or the profession.

The profession is a special job based on expertise, responsibility and welfare [1]. It means that a profession can't be done by just anyone who is not trained and not specially prepared to do the job. In other words, the profession is essentially a specific job that demands special requirements such as knowledge and experience gained from further education and special training. It aims to obtain a quality work, full of responsibility, not just randomly implemented.

Based on the results of a survey conducted by ECC UGM in 2015 showed that 67% of the respondents stated they were not working in a field appropriate to their educational background [2]. This amount is two times more than those who have worked according to their majors, i.e. as much as 33%. This shows that in the career, educational background is no longer a major requirement in the pursuit of a particular profession. Survey results also show that 58% percent of respondents feel that it is important to work in accordance with the college majors.

Furthermore, based on the results of Robst research in 2006, he found that forty five percent of workers report that their job is only partially related or not related to their field of study [3]. Forty-five percent of workers report that their job is only partially related or unrelated to their educational background. Based on these two data, it shows that a considerable number of undergraduate workers are not suited to their educational background.

The study programs at university are opened to meet specific job market needs. The study program aims to produce a competent output or graduate in the field so as to meet the needs of the community, especially the needs of the labor market. The study program of mathematics education basically aims to produce educators for the field of study of mathematics. With a special orientation, on the provision of teachers for secondary education.

Bachelor's work is not in accordance with educational background at the University is also experienced by bachelors of mathematics education. Mathematics education programs in general have a profile of graduates are as educators/teachers of mathematics, mathematics education researchers, and developers of learning resources or media of mathematics learning. In accordance with the profile of the graduates, the graduates can work as educators/teachers of mathematics, mathematics education researchers, and developers of learning resources or learning media of mathematics. The teachers are professional educators with the main task of educating, teaching, guiding, directing, training, assessing, and evaluating students in early childhood education formal education, basic education, and secondary education [1]. The knowledge, skills, competencies and experience gained during the lectures in mathematics education will be very useful if the graduates work according to the expected graduate profile of the study program.

Bachelor of mathematics education has at least three alternatives that can be taken after completing the lecture. First, after completing the lectures on mathematics education, they can work immediately. Second, continuing academic education. And third, continue the professional education of teachers.

Knowledge, competence, abilities and experience obtained by someone during the lecture will be more optimal if applied in accordance with the field. A bachelor of mathematics education who has earned lectures and understands how teaching and learning, learning psychology, experience in educating and teaching mathematics during field experience practice and other knowledge and experience will be very useful if they work in education competence. But the fact is, after they graduate and enter the world of work, not all work in education. Not a few graduates who work exactly as non-educators. They decided to work in field not related to educational background, not in accordance with the education, skills and competencies that they gained during their study in mathematics education. This is clearly contrary to the profile of graduates from the study program of mathematics education.

Universally, the reason for the phenomenon of non-conformity in the field of work with majors in lectures are:

1. The fact that the system of higher education has a distance to the world of work so that the success indicators of the study can't anticipate the competence of graduates needed to work (under qualification).
2. The world of work may not be well organized so that graduate skills can't be utilized efficiently (under utilization).
3. Graduates have capabilities that exceed the requirements of competence in the world of work (over qualification) [4].

In relation to these matters, the purpose of this study is to describe the causes why the bachelors of mathematics education work as non-educators.

METHOD

This study was a qualitative research with phenomenology approach. This study aimed to describe the causes why bachelors of mathematics education work as non-educators. Sources of data were 10 bachelors of mathematics education in Jambi who work as a non-educator. Their jobs were banker, the financial officer, civil service police, employees of private companies, civil servants (honorary) and the other jobs as non-educator.

The participant criteria in this study were:

1. A bachelor of mathematics education who works as non-educator proved by certificate of bachelor of mathematics education.
2. He/she has worked as non-educator that is proven by certificate of employment or other forms of evidence.

Data were collected by documentation and in-depth interviews. Documentation was done to examine and to prove their educational background and their jobs as non-educators. Documentation data sources were certificate of educational background from university and certificate of employment or other forms of evidence. Furthermore, individual in-depth interviews were done with 10 bachelor of mathematics education who work as non-educator. These interviews were done by semi-structured from October to December 2016. In this study, researcher was the main instrument.

Furthermore, the record data of the interview result was reduced. The reduction results were presented in the table and searched sub-themes in a relatively small group. Then, between one sub-theme with others sought the theme. Data analysis was done by determining the relationship between themes to gain understanding by using Boglan and Biklen model [5]. In this study, the relationship between themes was used to gain an understanding of the causes why bachelor of mathematics education work as non-educators.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

The reason for continuing lectures on the study program of mathematics education

One of someone's reasons continuing his lectures in mathematics education is interest in mathematics. Interest is a person's tendency towards something so that he feels interested to learn more deeply. This is because interest is related to curiosity [6]. Interests can also be a sense of preference and a sense of interest in a thing or activity, without anyone telling. Interest can be the cause or effect of an experience. This is because interest is closely related to encouragement, motives and human responses.

Factors affecting interest are divided into two, namely internal factors and external factors. One of internal factor is experience, while one of the external factors is family support. Experience is the result of a learning process that will add to individual insights. Individual experience while still studying in school influences his decision in choosing the study program at the university. This also applies to prospective new students who choose the study program of mathematics education. If learning mathematics in school is fun, then it will give effect of likes and interest to learn more. How teachers teach math is also one of the factors that causes someone to like mathematics.

Some statements of bachelors of mathematics education who work as non-educators support the theme of the reason for continuing lectures on the study program of mathematics education are as follows.

"... I've liked math subjects since I studied it at school ..." (Bachelor 1)

"... besides I like mathematics, I continue my study in the study program of mathematics education because my parents also want and support me to be a teacher ..." (Bachelor 3)

"... I was actually accepted as a new student of Informatics Engineering Department at UII Yogyakarta through achievement test, but because my parents didn't allow the lecture there, I finally took the test of admission of new students by choosing the study program of mathematics education in Jambi ..." (Bachelor 4)

"I'm not really interested in math. I am more interested in English, but since this study program is mathematics education using English, then that's the reason why I chose it ..." (Bachelor 7)

TABLE 1. The result of reduction related to the reason for continuing lectures on the study program of mathematics education

	Sub-theme	Relationship between sub-themes
1	Loved math subjects since studied it at school	The reason someone decided that to continue lectures on the study program of mathematics education has not been able to show that they fully want to be mathematics educators.
2	Support from parents	
3	Not so interested in math, but he chose it because of the standard of study program using English	

There are many reasons why someone decides to continue lectures in the study program of mathematics education and wants to become a teacher, from the very practical-pragmatic to the idealist. Whatever the reason, however incidentally, becoming a teacher requires acceptance and awareness of acceptance. Acceptance and awareness of acceptance is the entrance of a teacher or prospective teacher who will strengthen the soul and increase the determination to actively engage in maintaining and developing teacher identity, feelings and attitudes because the circumstances of learning are not always what is expected.

The number of human resources and employment

Limited jobs in public sector (Civil Servants) cause in limited quota given when receiving civil servants especially teacher. Not only that, the acceptance of prospective civil servants is not routinely held every year. It doesn't match the conditions where every year the university routinely passes its graduates. Comparison of the number of employment in the public sector (Civil Servants) and the number of job seekers who are not comparable, certainly will bring a level of intense competition. This also applies to bachelors of mathematics education who take the admissions test of civil servant candidates. The consequence is a situation where some bachelors of mathematics

education decide to become honorary teachers in public schools, contract teachers in private schools or private teachers.

Not only difficult to work in the public sector or become civil servants, but bachelors of mathematics education are also difficult to become honorary teachers in public schools or contract teachers in private schools. Being the honorary teacher with the goal of the next few years to become a civil servant status is also very difficult. In 2000, there were 84,000 honorary teachers in Indonesia. While based on data of 2015, the number of honorary teachers increased to 820 thousand people [7]. The increasing number of honorary teachers from year to year is due to the irresponsible school recruitment process. The number of honorary teachers who are too many is the root of the problem of honorary teachers not appointed civil servants.

An unbalanced number of human resources as the bachelors of mathematics education with educational employment is a factor that causes why some bachelors of mathematics education decide to work as non-educators. This condition is due to the difficulty of being accepted and working in the public sector (Civil Servants). In addition, it also causes many rivals to allow for unfair competition.

Some statements of bachelors of mathematics education who work as non-educators support the theme of the number of human resources and employment are as follows.

“...I have applied for a job in private schools in Jambi, but there is no call yet. If you want to be an honorary teacher in a public school, it’s quite difficult. Teachers with civil servant status are many who want to be reduced their teaching hours ...” (Bachelor 2)

“...after graduation, I became a private teacher and sometimes I also became a courier ...” (Bachelor 5)

TABLE 2. The result of reduction related to the number of human resources and employment

	Sub-theme	Relationship between sub-themes
1	Difficulties accepted as honorary teachers in public schools or contract teachers in private schools	The number of human resources (bachelor of mathematics education) and employment is not balanced.
2	Little opportunity to become a civil servant	
3	The number of undergraduates (human resources) and the admissions quota of civil servants are not balanced	

The imbalance between the number of bachelors of mathematics education and employment led to a very tough level of competition. This condition often leads to unfair selection. In recent years, the selection of civil servants is always followed by hundreds or even thousands of applicants, on the other hand, the candidate of bachelor of education who graduated each year add the long queue. This is the cause of bachelor of education, especially the bachelor of mathematics education decided to work as a non-educator.

Financial rewards

Financial reward is the ultimate expectation as a result of the accomplishment and work completed. In other words, financial rewards are rewards earned by a person based on the work completed. Financial rewards include salary/rewards, bonuses, and benefits. High or low salary received will affect a person to choose the job. While bonuses and benefits are an additional reward for one's performance.

The imbalance between the number of bachelors of mathematics education and employment causes some bachelors of mathematics education decided to become honorary teachers or contract teachers at school. The honorary teacher is a non-permanent teacher who has not yet a minimum status as a civil servant candidate, and is paid per hour lesson. The salary received by teachers who are in honorarium status in Jambi according to provincial minimum wage (including low-paying jobs). But the problem is the salary of honorary teachers that are often paid late, sometimes 3 months, even once every 6 months. It is clear that it is not in line with expectations and becomes an obstacle to meet daily needs. Meanwhile, a lot or a small salary earned is important to consider. The number of salary will provide individual motivation. This is one of some causes why the bachelors of mathematics education decided to work as a non-educator.

Some statements of bachelors of mathematics education who work as non-educators support the theme of the financial rewards are as follows.

“...Honestly, income affects my decision to work as a non-educator. I am not hypocritical that how much the salary received will surely consider the decision to choose it ...” (Bachelor 1)

“...I want to be a civil servant teacher, but if I am just a honorary teacher, I will look for other alternatives, such as applying for a job outside of education. I also want to be able to buy something for my parents ...” (Bachelor 6)

“...The salary earned by the teachers who are honorary was one of the main reasons why I decided to work as a non-educator ...” (Bachelor 8)

TABLE 3. The result of reduction related to the financial rewards

	Sub-theme	Relationship between sub-themes
1	The salary of teachers with honorary status is not sufficient	Financial rewards are one of the factors that influence the decision to work as a non-educator.
2	Salary is one of the main considerations in choosing a job	
3	The system of payment of salary of teachers who have an honorary status is not regular every month	

Working as an honorary teacher can be categorized as a low paying job in Indonesia. This condition is quite alarming because low salaries will increase the risk of being vulnerable. Low salaries are considered a stepping stone to obtain jobs that offer higher salaries. This became one of the major causes of bachelors of mathematics education deciding to work out of education, preferring other alternative jobs as non-educators who offer higher salary.

Talent and desire

Talent is one's ability. Talent is more known as a potential possibility that can be a capacity or a particular ability to learn or work. Someone who is studying in a study program in accordance with the talent, it will facilitate those skills into work skills. Furthermore, at the time of work, the teacher will apply his ability to educate students.

Teacher's job as a profession involves educating, teaching and training. Educating means continuing and developing the values of life. Teaching is an activity to develop science and technology and as a trainer, teachers must be able to develop and apply skills in everyday life. But in fact, today many teachers are not performing their duties properly. Not only teachers, even some bachelors of educations feel no talent, ability and desire to become an educator.

Meanwhile, the person who is successful in his work is the person who achieves what he wants. To achieve success in work, a person must have a clear desire, not just hope, to be achieved. This clear desire must be implanted in the subconscious mind so that it becomes a burning desire that will be able to give a strong impulse from within to achieve it. A bachelor of mathematics education when deciding to work as an educator or a non-educator is not only influenced by his talent but also his desires. Although the individual has been studying for 4 to 5 years, he has gained knowledge and experience, but if he has no desire to become a teacher, his knowledge and experience can't influence his decision.

Some statements of bachelors of mathematics education who work as non-educators support the theme of the talent and desire are as follows.

“...I decided to become a non-educator because I still have no desire to be a teacher ...” (Bachelor 7)

“...I feel that I have no talent in educating. If the role of the teacher is just teaching, I think I can do that, but the role of the teacher is to educate, teach, guide and advise the students, not just give knowledge ...” (Bachelor 9)

TABLE 4. The result of reduction related to talent and desire

	Sub-theme	Relationship between sub-themes
1	Feel no talent in educating students	Talent and desire influence one's decision to work as a non-educator
2	There is no desire to be a teacher	

The profession as a teacher is not an easy profession, the technical aspects (instrumental/ educational/teacher science) and the scientific substance (field of science being taught) that need to be mastered are the reasons. Teacher's

job is to educate, teach, guide, counsel, evaluate and facilitate. This shows that it takes a strong desire and sincerity in running the profession as a teacher. So, no wonder if the bachelor of education, especially mathematics education feels no desire to become educators, feel the saturation, feel not expert, or have no talent in educating and teaching. Although they have gained knowledge and experience during study in mathematics education in university, but after graduation they realize that they have no desire to become educators and have no talent or expertise in educating children.

The perception that the work of bachelor of mathematics education is flexible

One's decision to choose a job is influenced by his perception. Perception is one's response to an object that is influenced by new information from its environment. Perceptions received by a person is a process of action to compile, recognize, and interpret the information received in order to provide description and understanding.

The perception of bachelor of mathematics education influences his choice in choosing a job. For example, a bachelor or an educational student who shows his desire to become an educator e.g teacher or lecturer has the perception that an educator is cool, profession promising, and a fun profession. Some bachelors of mathematics education have a perception that the knowledge and experience gained during the lecture is not limited to the field of application. They have perception that bachelor of mathematics education does not have to work in the field of education nor they can develop their knowledge and competence by working in non-educational fields.

Some statements of bachelors of mathematics education who work as non-educators support the theme of the perception that the work of bachelor of mathematics education is flexible are as follows.

“...Bachelors of mathematics education can have flexible jobs. I mean that I do not have to work in education because all work related to math ...” (Bachelor 3)

“...I think that math covers all aspects of life including my current job. And the essence of college is not only to explore the science of our majors, but also as the process of formation of mindset. Mathematics is more flexible when compared with other sciences ...” (Bachelor 4)

“...I want to try to be an officer...” (Bachelor 10)

TABLE 5. The result of reduction related to the perception that the work of bachelor of mathematics education is flexible

	Sub-theme	Relationship between sub-themes
1	The perception that bachelors of mathematics education can have flexible jobs because all work related to math	The perception of some bachelors of mathematics education that they can have flexible jobs, so they don't have to work in education.
2	The nature of college is not only seeking or deepening our departmental science, but also as a process of mindset formation	

The perception that bachelor of math education can have flexible jobs is not something wrong. However, the knowledge, skills, competencies and experience gained during lectures on mathematics education will be very useful if the graduates work according to the expected graduate profile of the study program.

Discussion

The study program aims to produce a competent outputs or bachelors in the field so that it can meet the needs of the community, especially the needs of the labor market. The study program of mathematics education basically aims to produce the mathematics educators who have pedagogic, professional, personal, and social competence, as an agent of math learners at school, researchers of mathematics education, or the graduates with basic mathematics and mathematics education enough to continue their study to a higher level. It's clear that the study program wants to produce the competent mathematics educators.

But in fact, some bachelors of mathematics education work as non-educator. This is clearly contrary to the profile of mathematics education graduates such as educators or teachers of mathematics, researchers of mathematics education, and developers of learning resources or media of mathematics learning. The knowledge, skills,

competencies and experience gained during lectures on mathematics education will be very useful if the graduates work according to the expected graduate profile of the study program.

Bachelors of Mathematics education work as non-educator caused by several factors. These factors are the reasons for continuing lectures on mathematics education, the number of human resources and employment is not balanced, inadequate financial rewards, talents and desires, and the perception that bachelor of mathematics education job's is flexible.

In general, a person chooses the study program of mathematics education because he/she wants to be an educator or has a high interest in math. Interest is a feeling or emotion that cause attention to focus on an object or an event or a process [8]. Furthermore, Scraw and Lehman [9] said that interest refers to liking and willful engagement in an activity. Liking in math at school can influence the decision to choose the study program of mathematics education at the university. The feeling such as like or dislike math can be influenced by learning experience math at school. That experience can influence one's decision to study in a program [10]. The consequences, he/she wanted to learn more and more deeply about mathematics. In addition, Turner and Bowen [11] said that the ability of a subject also influences the individual reason for choosing the study program. For example, students who master and have math skills at school are more likely to choose engineering, technical, and medical majors.

Not only that, however when deciding to study in mathematics education program, prospective teachers hold some beliefs about mathematics, teaching and learning, teaching objectives, and their ability in teaching math [12]. When someone decides on mathematics education as his goal, then at least he can judge himself and prepare some of these aspects.

Based on the results of in-depth interviews with some participants, it can be concluded that not all prospective students choose the study program of mathematics education because he wants to become an educator or like mathematics. Some bachelors said that they chose the study program of mathematics education because their parents didn't allow lectures in other provinces or there was a part of the study program of mathematics education that they like, for example the language of instruction used was English. It's clear that their reasons for continuing lectures on mathematics education were not entirely to be an educator.

The number of unbalanced human resources and employment is also the cause why some bachelors of mathematics education decide to work as non-educators. Limited quota needed in the public sector (civil servants), strict selection and the amount of competition are some conditions faced by bachelors of mathematics education who are looking for job. The level of competition is very tight and the selection is usually unfair or the fraud makes the opportunity smaller to be a civil servant [13]. Every year, the selection of civil servants always leaves hundreds of applicants and recent graduates add to an increasingly long queue while opportunities are small.

Other causes that causes this phenomenon is salary. The salary offered from a job is something very important. The salary lies behind a person to work for the purpose of fulfilling his or her life's needs and it also influences a person's decision to choose the desired job. Financial rewards are the remuneration in the form of money given to a person for the work and his contribution in helping and contributing in achieving the goals of the organization, agency or company. Financial rewards are realized in the form of salaries, bonuses and allowances to provide satisfaction to employees for their performance. Furthermore, financial rewards are one reason for one to work and are the most important reason among others such as achievement, affiliation with others, self-development, or self-actualization [14].

One of the objectives of financial reward is to meet the physical needs and employee social status, so that employees obtain job satisfaction and to prevent employees from moving to other similar companies [15]. The amount of salary received by bachelor of mathematics education who work as honorary teachers is not sufficient to cause some of them decided to work as non-educators who offer higher salaries. It means that salary is one of some causes why the bachelors of mathematics education work as non-educators.

Not only the reasons for continuing lectures on mathematics education, the number of unbalanced human resources and employment, and inadequate financial rewards, but also talents and desires can influence decision of bachelor of mathematics education to work as non-educators. If he feels no talent in educating or a desire to become a teacher, then it can affect his decision to work out the world of education. Talent is an individual's ability to perform certain tasks without much dependence on educational and training efforts [16]. In general, talent is a potential ability that someone has to achieve success in the future [17].

Teacher's job is not just going to class, talking to students, giving training and homework, then finished the teacher's work. Teacher must have a strong desire to be a professional teacher who facilitate student to learn mathematics. But today many teachers are not performing their duties properly, they think that their work will be completed only by teaching in the classroom. Not only teachers, even some bachelors of mathematics education feel

no talent, ability and desire to become an educator. It is a bad condition in education if someone who has studied mathematics in more depth feels no talent and desire to become an educator.

The last cause why the bachelors of mathematics education work as non-educator is their perception. Perception is how we see the world around us. Perception is defined as the process by which a person selects, organizes, interprets the stimulus in a picture of the world as a whole [18]. Perceptions include the acceptance of information that is further processed and interpreted which may affect behavior and shape attitudes. This happens because perception involves the interpretation of the individual on a particular object, so each object has a different perception despite seeing the same object.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the analysis, it was found that the causes of bachelors of mathematics education work as non-educators include the following matters. First, the reason for continuing lectures on mathematics education was not entirely to be an educator or to learn more about math. Second, the number of human resources and employment is not balanced. It means that an unbalanced number of human resources as the bachelors of mathematics education with educational employment is a factor that causes why some bachelors of mathematics education decide to work as non-educators. Third, the income received by honorary teachers is not appropriate to the needs (financial reward). Fourth, some bachelors of mathematics education feel no talent in educating and have no desire to be a teacher. Fifth, the perception that the work of bachelor of mathematics education is flexible.

REFERENCES

1. Rugaiyah and Sismiati Atik, *Profesi Kependidikan* (Ghalia Indonesia, Jakarta, 2011).
2. ECC UGM, 67% *Lulusan Mendapat Pekerjaan yang Tidak Sesuai Jurusan saat Kuliah* (www.careernews.id, 2015)
3. J. Robst, "Education and job match: the relatedness of collage major and work", in *Economic of Education Review* vol 26, pp. 397-407 (2006).
4. P. Kellermann and G. Sagmeister, "Higher education and graduate employment", in *Austria European Journal of Education* vol 35 No 2 (2000).
5. R. C. Boglan and S. K. Biklen, *Qualitative Research for Education: an Introduction to Theory and Methods* (Allyn and Bacon, Inc, Boston, MA, 1982).
6. S. N. Elliot, et al, *Educational Psychology: Effective Teaching, Effective Learning* (MCGraW-Hill Companies, Inc, Boston, 2000).
7. A. Santoso, *Menteri Anies: Jumlah Guru Honorer Melonjak Tajam Dibanding Siswa* (news.liputan6.com, 2016)
8. B. K. Pal, *Educational Psychology* (Prema Parkashan, Delhi, 2011).
9. D.H. Schunk, et al, *Motivation in Education* (Pearson Education, Inc, Upper Saddle River, 2010).
10. L. J. Spielman, *Perceptive Teachers' Characterizations of the Relationships between Teacher Education Program Component: Program Meaning and Relevance and Socio-Political School Geographies* (unpublished, 2006).
11. T. Bailey, et al, *Matching All Students to Postsesondary Opportunities: Matching Talents to Careers* (Community College Research Center, Teachers College, Columbia University, 2015).
12. R. J. Milgram, *The Mathematics Pre-service Teachers Need to Know* (Department of Mathematics, Stanford University, California, 2005).
13. M. Nazili, and M. T. Nurmadiansyah, "Tracer study alumni fakultas dakwah", in *Jurnal Dakwah*, vol X No. 1 pp. 104 (2009).
14. M. Kadarisman, *Manajemen kompensasi* (Rajawali Press, Jakarta, 2012).
15. V. Rivai, and E. J. Sagala, *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia untuk Perusahaan ed 2* (PT. Rajagrafindo Persada, Jakarta, 2011).
16. M. Syah, *Psikologi Pendidikan dengan Pendekatan Baru* (PT. Remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung, 2013).
17. S. B. Djamarah, *Psikologi Belajar* (Rineka Cipta, Jakarta, 2008).
18. B. Simamora, *Panduan Riset Perilaku Konsumen* (PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama, Jakarta, 2002).